# 3 4

# 5

## 6 7 8

9 10

11 12 13

14 15 16

> 18 19 20

17

21 22

23 24 25

27 28 29

26

31 32

33

30

34 35 36

37 38 39

40 41

42

43

44

45 46

## MINUTES OF THE REGULAR MEETING **WEDNESDAY, JUNE 14, 2023**

**REGULAR MEETING: 7:00 PM** 

#### 1. **CALL TO ORDER**

Commissioner Pilch called the regular meeting of the Planning and Zoning Commission to order at 7:00 p.m. on Wednesday, June 14, 2023.

#### **ROLL CALL / LAND ACKNOWLEDGEMENT** 2.

Hudson, MacLeod, Momin, Pilch, Watty Present:

Absent: None

Staff Present: Community Development Director Jeff Bond

Transportation & Sustainability Manager Justin Fried Interim Associate Planner Sophie Gabel-Scheinbaum

The Albany Land Acknowledgement Statement was read as adopted by the City Council per City of Albany Minute Action, November 15, 2021.

#### 3. **EX-PARTE COMMUNICATIONS**

None.

#### 4. CONSENT CALENDAR

#### 4-1. Planning and Zoning Commission Meeting Minutes May 10, 2023

**Recommendation:** Staff recommends that the Planning and Zoning Commission review and approve the meeting minutes.

**Motion to approve** the consent calendar. (no motion made)

Seconded by (no second made)

AYES: Hudson, MacLeod, Momin, Pilch, Watty

NOES: None ABSTAIN: None ABSENT: None

Motion passed, 5-0-0-0

#### 5. ANNOUNCEMENTS / COMMUNICATIONS

Commissioner Pilch indicated that the Albany Twin may be closing.

Commissioner Hudson announced a local postal vehicle was broken into and the mail stolen.

1

6

21

14 15

> 27 28 29

> 30 31

> 32

26

33 34 35

36

37

38

39 40 41

42 43 44

45

46

6. **PUBLIC COMMENTS** 

None.

#### 7. DISCUSSION AND POSSIBLE ACTION ON MATTERS RELATED TO THE **FOLLOWING ITEMS:**

7-1. **Encroachment Permit Application for Outdoor Dining Parklet for "5 Tacos &** Beers" at 1175 Solano Avenue - On September 19, 2022, the City Council approved the City's Parklet Program Regulations, which allows for temporary outdoor uses on public right-of-way on Solano Avenue. Applications that involve three parking spaces and applications that have unique considerations require Planning and Zoning Commission consideration.

**Recommendation:** Staff recommends that the Planning and Zoning Commission review and recommend staff approve the encroachment permit for the proposed outdoor dining parklet, subject to the conditions of approval.

California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA): The project is categorically exempt from CEQA pursuant to Section 15303 "New Construction or Conversion of Small Structures" of the CEQA Guidelines.

Transportation & Sustainability Manager Fried presented the staff report dated June 14, 2023.

## PUBLIC HEARING OPENED

Unknown speaker believed there is a lack of parking along Solano Avenue and felt parklets are having deleterious effects on businesses.

**Unknown speaker** noted the loss of 17 parking spaces due to parklets and requested a parklet for customer parking at his business.

## PUBLIC HEARING CLOSED

Commissioner Hudson referenced public comment regarding table placement and shared her observation of tables encroaching into pathways. If the tables are incorporated into the parklet, their placement should be considered.

Commissioner Pilch presumed that the business would alter any current conditions that do not comply with the encroachment permit.

Commissioner MacLeod indicated the application appears to remedy circulation issues through the removal of tables along the north side of the sidewalk. The number of seats is reduced in the application. The current materials, if they are re-used, should be sufficient in the area.

 Commissioner Watty advised that the issue before the Planning and Zoning Commission (Commission) is the aesthetics and accessibility of the parklet and the quality of the materials. The parklet materials do need freshening up. 5 Tacos & Beers has become a focal point and hub of civic life for Lower Solano. The Commission may wish to encourage

freshened or cleaned up. While the loss of parking is a concern, parklets have a net

positive impact by animating life on the street. Studies have shown that parking is

Commissioner Momin agreed that loss of parking is a small cost for improving the vitality and walkability of the street. Pedestrians walking in front of businesses may increase sales. The parklet is the one of the most vibrant along Solano Avenue. Pushing the perimeter wall back from the street improves pedestrian safety. The barrels give the parklet a makeshift look and should be replaced with elements that easily connect to the wall. Maintenance of the existing materials would be a great improvement.

Commissioner Pilch concurred with Commissioners' comments. 5 Tacos & Beers is an asset to the community, but it has pushed the boundaries by relocating the bike rack and encroaching into pathways. The new tree will be an asset for the business and the public.

**Motion to approve** an encroachment permit application for "5 Tacos & Beers" at 1175 Solano Avenue. Watty

Seconded by MacLeod

AYES: Hudson, MacLeod, Momin, Pilch, Watty

the business to extend existing landscaping into the parklet.

NOES: None ABSTAIN: None ABSENT: None

Motion passed, 5-0-0-0

**7-2.** Encroachment Permit Application for Outdoor Dining Parklet for "Bua Luang Thai Cuisine" at 1166 Solano Avenue — On September 19, 2022, the City Council approved the City's Parklet Program Regulations, which allows for temporary outdoor uses on public right-of-way on Solano Avenue. Applications that involve three parking spaces and applications that have unique considerations require Planning and Zoning Commission consideration.

**Recommendation:** Staff recommends that the Planning and Zoning Commission review and recommend staff approve the encroachment permit for the proposed outdoor dining parklet, subject to conditions of approval.

California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA): The project is categorically exempt from CEQA pursuant to Section 15303 "New Construction or Conversion of Small Structures" of the CEQA Guidelines.

3 4

1

12 13 14

15

10 11

20 21 22

23

28

36 37 38

39

40

35

41 42

44 45

46

43

Commissioner Pilch supported the application. Parklets do not improve or worsen pedestrian safety. The current parklet is acceptable, but improvements are welcome.

Transportation & Sustainability Manager Fried presented the staff report dated June 14, 2023.

## PUBLIC HEARING OPENED

**Unknown speaker** questioned whether there is an upper limit on the use of parking for parklets as the loss of parking has detrimental effects on businesses.

**Unknown speaker** inquired regarding the City's liability should someone in a parklet be injured by a vehicle and the length of time until an encroachment permit expires.

Estrella Sangburg suggested the City work with businesses to obtain their support and provide the parking study to businesses and the public.

**Unknown speaker** stated the Commission approved one parklet and should approve the remaining applications as they are one and the same.

## PUBLIC HEARING CLOSED

Transportation & Sustainability Manager Fried shared the history of discussions regarding a cap on parklets and review of permits after three years.

Community Development Director Jeff Bond added that permittees are required to provide proof of insurance and name the City as an additional insured. The Council decided not to charge an annual fee per vehicle space for the three-year cycle.

Commissioner Watty remarked that the proposal is a dramatic improvement for the current parklet. The parklet will feel more permanent with higher-quality materials and a solid perimeter wall. The application complies with adopted standards and recommendations. The City had not developed a parklet program for the emergency order allowing parklets during the pandemic. Without clear guidance, restaurants developed parklets of temporary architectural design and utilized a hodge podge of materials. With the parklet program in place, restaurants need to utilize solid and proper materials that can last for the next three years.

Commissioner Momin appreciated the improved design and layout for the parklet. The parklet has sufficient space for more plants.

Commissioner MacLeod indicated the current proposal is simple and more straightforward than the previous proposal. The design is good. The parklets are meant to be removable should encroachment permits not continue at the end of the three-year cycle.

**Motion to approve** an encroachment permit for "Bua Luang Thai Cuisine" at 1166 Solano Avenue. Watty

Seconded by Momin

AYES: Hudson, MacLeod, Momin, Pilch, Watty

NOES: None ABSTAIN: None ABSENT: None

Motion passed, 5-0-0-0

7-3. Encroachment Permit Application for Outdoor Dining Parklet for "Everest Kitchen" at 1150 Solano Avenue – On September 19, 2022, the City Council approved the City's Parklet Program Regulations, which allows for temporary outdoor uses on public right-of-way on Solano Avenue. Applications that involve three parking spaces and applications that have unique considerations require Planning and Zoning Commission consideration.

**Recommendation:** Staff recommends that the Planning and Zoning Commission review and recommend staff approve the encroachment permit for the proposed outdoor dining parklet, subject to conditions of approval.

**CEQA:** The project is Categorically exempt from CEQA pursuant to Section 15303 "New Construction or Conversion of Small Structures" of the CEQA Guidelines.

Transportation & Sustainability Manager Fried presented the staff report dated June 14, 2023.

## PUBLIC HEARING OPENED

**Nick Peterson** found parklets helpful in reducing traffic speed and accommodating bicycles.

## PUBLIC HEARING CLOSED

Commissioners Watty, Momin, and Pilch supported the proposed design.

Commissioner MacLeod understood the perimeter barriers are to be 42 inches in height to prevent people from falling into the street. Generally, the proposal is fine.

Transportation & Sustainability Manager Fried related the height requirements of 42 inches from the street surface and 36 inches from the sidewalk.

Motion to approve an encroachment permit for "Everest Kitchen" at 1150 Solano

Avenue. Watty Seconded by MacLeod

AYES: Hudson, MacLeod, Momin, Pilch, Watty

NOES: None

ABSTAIN: None ABSENT: None

1

2

3 4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18 19

20

21

22

23

24 25

26

27

28

29

30 31

32

33

34

35

36 37 38

39

40 41

42

43

44 45 Motion passed, 5-0-0-0

7-4. Resolution No. 2023-02 and Resolution 2023-03 Recommending to the City Council Approval of Amendments to the Transportation Element of the General Plan and Amendments to Chapters 20.20 and 20.28 of the Zoning Ordinance to Modify Off-Street Parking Requirements – The proposed amendments codify changes to parking regulations in response to Assembly Bill (AB) 2097. AB 2097, which was passed into law in 2022, eliminated off-street parking requirements within one-half mile of major transit stops. The proposed General Plan amendments and Planning and Zoning Code amendments would requirements remove minimum parking citywide, except racetrack/Waterfront zoning district. It also establishes maximum parking requirements for multifamily, commercial, industrial, and public uses. The proposed amendments also would remove various code sections that allow reductions or provide exceptions since they would no longer be necessary. The proposed amendments are categorically exempt from the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA).

**Recommendation:** Staff recommends that the Planning and Zoning Commission approve Resolution No. 2023-02 and Resolution No. 2023-03 recommending to the City Council approval of amendments to the Transportation Element of the General Plan and amendments to Chapters 20.20 and 20.28 of the Zoning Ordinance to modify off-street parking requirements.

California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA): The proposed amendments are within the scope of the General Plan Environmental Impact Report (EIR), certified by the City Council on April 18, 2016. Nothing in these revisions constitute significant changes to the project studied in the EIR and any revisions will not cause any new significant impacts, or substantially more severe impacts than those evaluated in the EIR such that a subsequent or supplemental EIR or negative declaration would be required pursuant to CEQA Guidelines sections 15162 and 15163; and none of the other conditions described in CEQA Guidelines section 15162 calling for the preparation of a subsequent EIR or negative declaration have occurred.

Jean Eisberg, Lexington Planning, presented the staff report dated June 14, 2023.

## PUBLIC HEARING OPENED

**Darla** inquired regarding parking requirements for the Albany Family Housing project under the new law. If the project does not have to provide parking, approval of the project should be reviewed.

**Unknown speaker** opposed zero parking requirements. Perhaps the City should not comply with the law or should require off-street parking for accessory dwelling units (ADU).

**Unknown speaker** opposed anything that brings more cars into the City because the pollution from cars makes people sick.

**Nick Peterson** supported zero parking minimums because there are many alternatives to driving a car. Parking minimums have resulted in more traffic, more cars, reduced street safety, and increased pollution and global warming.

**Harry Chomsky** supported the proposed amendments because they get closer to the ideal scenario of people understanding the cost of parking and paying the cost when they want to.

**Clay Larson** believed discussions about curb management and transportation demand management (TDM) need to happen sooner rather than later.

**Elaine Stelton** noticed cars encroaching into driveways due to the loss of parking on Kains Avenue. An Albany police officer told her that cars strike buildings about 20 times per month in Albany. Loading and 10-minute parking zones, parking enforcement, and red curbs at driveways would be useful.

#### PUBLIC HEARING CLOSED

Commissioner MacLeod advised that the state law instituting zero parking minimums applies to about 75% of the City. The proposal extends the minimums to the rest of the City. A project may provide more parking than required. The proposal is quite reasonable, furthers transit and climate action goals, and is a better utilization of space for housing. The City should revisit its TDM requirements and make them more robust. Berkeley's 0.5 parking maximum near transit stops is not discouraging housing development.

Commissioner Momin believed the proposal will comply with state law and reduce vehicle emissions and dependence on vehicles. In his experience as an architect, projects provide more parking than required. The proposal will benefit housing affordability.

Commissioner Watty supported the inclusion of portions of Albany that are not affected by the state law. Applying different regulations to areas that appear the same is complicated for staff and a disservice to the community. The proposal will not require homeowners, landlords, or business owners to make changes to existing parking. The proposal targets developers, and developers are aware of market demands. If the rules are adopted and prove to be wrong, they can be changed.

Commissioner Hudson expressed concern regarding the inconvenience of reduced onsite parking for people with disabilities, aged citizens, and families. Lower parking requirements improve land use and rely on public transit that may not be adequate for the

community's needs. Businesses in the City need parking because they attract a large number of people from outside Albany.

Commissioner Pilch reported the Albany Family Housing project will provide one parking space per unit. Parking management and TDM programs impact some streets more than others. The Commission may want to consider requiring loading zones and accessible parking spaces for all projects and unbundled parking for rental and for-purchase condominium projects. Mr. Larson's suggested revisions should be made. Language regarding Measure D should note voters' passage of an amendment to eliminate parking requirements in Measure D.

Commissioner MacLeod agreed with requiring unbundled parking for both rental and forpurchase condominium projects.

Community Development Director Bond noted the complexity of purchasing and selling a condominium and a separate parking space.

Commissioner Watty believed language could be crafted such that purchasing a condominium does not involve two transactions. A buyer should be able to choose parking or no parking.

Commissioner MacLeod understood the Commission would discuss TDM programs at some time in the future. More thought and discussion of the issues are needed. The addition to Section 20.28.020K of the Zoning Ordinance needs to be more specific and should have a dollar value for transit passes.

Commissioner Momin recalled the Commission's discussion of requiring transit passes based on number of bedrooms in a unit versus one pass per unit.

Commissioner Watty suggested the Commission defer revision of the transit pass language to a future TDM discussion.

Ms. Eisberg clarified that the comment on page 4-30 of the Transportation Element is intended to incorporate the passage of Measure D into the text.

Motion to approve Resolution No. 2023-02 and Resolution 2023-03 recommending to the City Council approval of amendments to the Transportation Element of the General Plan and amendments to Chapters 20.20 and 20.28 of the Zoning Ordinance to modify off-street parking requirements with an amendment to unbundle parking for sale and rental projects. Watty

Seconded by Momin

AYES: Hudson, MacLeod, Momin, Pilch, Watty

NOES: None ABSTAIN: None ABSENT: None

Motion passed, 5-0-0-0

20

21 22

13

14 15

23 24 25

27 28 29

30 31

26

40 41 42

39

43

44 45 46

#### 8. **NEW BUSINESS**

Planning Application 23-021 Study Session for New Residential Units at 925 8-1. Adams Street – An application has been submitted for Design Review approval for two (2) new residential units and a conversion and remodel of an existing building at 925 Adams St. The subject property is a 5,000-sq.-ft. lot with one existing 1,928-sq.-ft. 2-story building currently used commercially. The project proposes to remodel and convert the existing building into a 3-bedroom 3bathroom residential unit and add two (2) additional 3-story residential units of approx. 1,600 sq. ft. each. The new units are proposed to have 3 bedrooms, 3 or 4 bathrooms, roof decks and garages. This will result in three separate residential units totaling 5,146 sq. ft. with a maximum height of 32' 11". This is a study session, and no action will be taken.

Recommendation: For discussion only. This is a study session, and no action will be taken.

California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA): The project is expected to be categorically exempt from CEQA pursuant to Section 15303 "New Construction or Conversion of Small Structures" of the CEQA Guidelines.

By acclamation, the Commission extended the meeting past 9:30 p.m.

Interim Associate Planner Sophie Gabel-Scheinbaum presented the staff report dated June 14, 2023.

Henry Fleischmann, applicant representative, reported the project proposes three units in order to provide open space and retain the existing building. The two front units are split to avoid the massing of one building and create a diversity of buildings. The distance between the two buildings is 4 feet to accommodate stairways and usable space inside each building. The project proposes to relocate the curb cut in an effort to set the buildings as far back from the existing oak tree as possible. The building height of 32' 11" is measured from the ground to the roof access hatch. The windows are placed to provide privacy for adjacent residences. The view from the third-story roof deck will be over the surrounding lots rather than into the lots. When asked, Mr. Fleishmann advised that bicycle parking is located across from unit 3 and labeled on sheet A-0.2. Currently, there are no provisions for cargo bikes. The oak tree sits on the property line. He and his staff arborist have discussed preserving the tree. The garages are small and intended to be used for charging compact vehicles overnight.

Community Development Director Bond related that he would ask the City Arborist to review standard conditions of approval for tree protection and monitor the tree during construction.

PUBLIC HEARING OPENED

 **Unknown speaker** shared neighbors' concerns regarding trees, particularly the oak tree; impacts on residences at 919 and 929 Adams; and parking.

**Janelle** indicated neighbors were unaware that the San Pablo Avenue Specific Plan affects development on Adams. The project will be incongruent with the neighborhood.

Pantip Chawalit expressed concern that the buildings will block sunlight to his solar panels.

PUBLIC HEARING CLOSED

Commissioner Watty believed the project needs a clear residential entryway facing the street. The cantilevered portion of the second building feels awkward and not intentional. The concept of three detached single-family homes is a great way to provide incremental densification and keep the single-family aesthetic. The proposed height is not a concern. The neighborhood has a pattern of similarly scaled buildings. Perhaps the tree that is special to the neighbors could be relocated.

Commissioner Momin appreciated the arrangement of the approach with the two units and the courtyard with parking in front of unit 3. The interior planning is good. There is not much interaction between the front courtyard and the building. Closing the gap between units 1 and 2 would provide more space between units 2 and 3 and an open feeling for the whole area. Maneuvering cars in and out of the garages is a concern.

Commissioner MacLeod encouraged the applicant to build more units if possible. The gap between units 1 and 2 does not serve a purpose and probably will not be used. A party wall would reduce the building's energy usage. The parapet could be pulled back from 919 Adams. The bump out is awkward. The elevations are inconsistent, and the design logic among the elevations is not apparent. The street side seems unwelcoming. Adaptive reuse of the rear building is a good approach to conserve resources and reduce the building's carbon footprint. A more convenient and accessible bike storage system with space for cargo bikes would be great. Roof decks are a great way to create more open space for the project.

Commissioner Pilch stated the project is a great improvement for the lot. The project provides on-site parking. The street side is not usable or a good use of space. The bike parking needs to be enclosed and secured.

9. NEXT MEETING: June 28, 2023 at 7:00 PM

#### 10. ADJOURNMENT

The meeting was adjourned at 10:18 p.m.

| ļ |   |
|---|---|
| 2 |   |
| 3 |   |
| 4 | Submitted by:                             |
| 5 |   |
| 6 |   |
| 7 |   |
| 8 |   |
| 9 | Jeff Bond, Community Development Director |