MINUTES OF REGULAR MEETING WEDNESDAY, JULY 14, 2021

at 7:00 p.m. on Wednesday, July 14, 2021.

3 4

5

1

2

# 1. CALL TO ORDER

6 7 8

# 2. ROLL CALL

9 10 11

12

13

Present:

Donaldson, Pilch, Watty

Absent:

MacLeod. Momin

Staff Present:

Planning Manager Anne Hersch

Associate Planner Christopher Tan

14 15 16

# 3. EX PARTE COMMUNICATIONS

17 18

Commissioner Pilch disclosed a visit to 915 Stannage and conversation with the occupant regarding PA21-044 for 1175 Solano Avenue.

Chair Watty called the regular meeting of the Planning and Zoning Commission to order

19 20 21

# 4. CONSENT CALENDAR

2223

# 4-1. Planning & Zoning Commission Meeting Minutes of June 23, 2021

24 25

**Recommendation:** Staff recommends that the Planning & Zoning Commission review and approve the meeting minutes.

262728

29

30 31

32

33

Motion to approve Item 4-1 of the consent calendar. Donaldson

Seconded by Pilch

4-3.

AYES: Donaldson, Pilch, Watty

NAYES: None RECUSED: None

ABSENT: MacLeod, Momin

34 35 Motion passed, 3-0-0-2

36 37

38

39

40

41

42

43

44

The applicant is seeking Design Review approval for a two-level rear addition at 622 Curtis Street. The subject property is a 4,000-sq.-ft. lot with a 2-bedroom, 1-bathroom, 1,037-sq.-ft. house built in 1925. The project scope includes building a 550-sq.-ft. two-level addition at the rear of the home to accommodate a laundry room, 2 bedrooms and 1 bathroom. The upper-level bedroom is proposed to have a 42-sq.-ft. balcony with slider doors that open and face the rear yard. The exterior of the addition is proposed to be clad in horizontal wood paneling with a hipped

roof to match the existing home. The existing architectural style of the home is

PA21-047 Design Review for a Two-Level Rear Addition at 622 Curtis Street

proposed to remain. This will result in a 4-bedroom, 2-bathroom, 1,587-sq.-ft. home with a maximum height of 18 feet. Two off-street parking spaces are provided in the attached garage and driveway.

**Recommendation:** Staff recommends that the Planning & Zoning Commission review and approve the proposed project subject to the attached findings and Conditions of Approval.

**CEQA:** The project is Categorically exempt from CEQA pursuant to Section 15303 "New Construction or Conversion of Small Structures" of the CEQA Guidelines.

Commissioner Pilch recused himself from this item as his residence is located within 500 feet of the subject property.

Planning Manager Anne Hersch announced the Commission may not act on the item as a quorum of the Commission is not present. The item is continued to the next meeting.

**4-2. PA21-046 Temporary Use Permit for Foodieland at Golden Gate Fields (1100 Eastshore)** – The applicant is seeking Temporary Use Permit approval for Foodieland Night Market at Golden Gate Fields. Foodieland Night Market is an Asian-inspired street food festival with over 100+ food vendors, food trucks, and art/crafts and merchandise vendors. The event is proposed to be held over three weekends: August 20-22, 2021, October 8-10, 2021, and October 15-17, 2021. The event times are 3 pm-10 pm on Fridays and 11 am – 10 pm on Saturdays and Sundays in the north parking lot of Golden Gate Fields. Approximately 5,000 - 6,000 attendees at any given time and up to 40,000 attendees are expected over a three-day period. Attendees are expected to stay for a maximum of 2-3 hours. Vehicle and bicycle parking is proposed at both the Buchanan Street and Gilman Street entrances on the subject property. ADA designated parking is available through Buchanan Street. The applicant operated the same event at Golden Gate Fields in 2019.

**Recommendation:** Staff recommends that the Planning & Zoning Commission review and approve the proposed project subject to the attached findings and Conditions of Approval.

**CEQA:** The project is Categorically exempt from CEQA pursuant to Section 15332 "In-Fill Development Projects" of the CEQA Guidelines.

Commissioner Pilch appreciated the suggestions from Ms. Smolens.

**Kevin Wang** agreed to implement Ms. Smolens' suggestions and advised that the bike corral will be located closer to the main exit where a security guard will be stationed.

4

14 15 16

12

13

18 19 20

21

17

30

37 38

35 36

39 40 41

42

43 44 PUBLIC HEARING OPENED

# PUBLIC HEARING CLOSED

None

Motion to approve PA21-046 for 1100 Eastshore subject to the findings and Conditions of Approval and additional Conditions of Approval to provide more wayfinding signage to bicycle parking and enclose bicycle parking along with encouragement for the applicant to include free bicycle parking in marketing materials and social media posts. Pilch

Seconded by Donaldson

Donaldson, Pilch, Watty AYES:

NAYES: None RECUSED: None

ABSENT: MacLeod, Momin

Motion passed, 3-0-0-2

Chair Watty noted the appeal period.

PA21-048 Conditional Use Permit Amendment for Chef's Touch Kitchen & 4-4. Catering at 578 Cleveland Ave. - The applicant is seeking an amendment to a previously approved Major Conditional Use Permit for Chef's Touch Kitchen & Catering at 578 Cleveland Avenue. The applicant previously applied for a Type 41 (On Sale Beer & Wine) and a Type 58 (Caterer's Permit) license with the Department of Alcoholic Beverage Control. An amendment was filed and approved in 2019 for a Type 75 "brew pub" license and elimination of the Type 41 license. The applicant is proposing to amend the permit to eliminate the Type 75 brew pub license to a Type 47 to allow the sale of beer, wine and spirits for a full-service restaurant. No alterations to the subject property are proposed under this project scope. (This is an amendment to PA 19-023 Conditional Use Permit).

**Recommendation:** Staff recommends that the Planning & Zoning Commission review and approve the proposed project subject to the attached findings and Conditions of Approval.

CEQA: The project is Categorically exempt from CEQA pursuant to Section 15332 "In-Fill Development Projects" of the CEQA Guidelines.

Planning Manager Hersch summarized the applicant's proposed changes.

## PUBLIC HEARING OPENED

A resident inquired about signage that may be a nuisance for nearby residents.

# PUBLIC HEARING CLOSED

Planning Manager Hersch advised that the applicant's proposed signage was approved in 2019, and the proposed signage complies with Code requirements.

Motion to approve PA21-048 for 578 Cleveland Avenue pursuant to the proposed

Seconded by Pilch

AYES: Donaldson, Pilch, Watty

findings and Conditions of Approval. Donaldson

 NAYES: None RECUSED: None

ABSENT: MacLeod, Momin

Motion passed, 3-0-0-2

Chair Watty noted the appeal period.

# 5. ANNOUNCEMENTS/COMMUNICATIONS

None

7-1.

#### 6. PUBLIC COMMENT

None

# 7. DISCUSSION & POSSIBLE ACTION ON MATTERS RELATED TO THE FOLLOWING ITEMS:

Avenue, Five Tacos – The applicant is seeking Conditional Use Permit approval to have live entertainment at 1175 Solano Avenue, Five Tacos restaurant. The subject business is located at the northeast corner of Solano and Stannage Avenue. The proposed scope includes live music with a maximum of five (5) performers on Tuesday 5-9 pm, Friday/Saturday 5-9 pm, and Sunday 11 am-3 pm. Performers will be located on the upper portion of the patio/bar area.

**Recommendation:** Staff recommends that the Planning & Zoning Commission review and approve the proposed project subject to the attached findings and Conditions of Approval.

PA21-044 Conditional Use Permit for Live Entertainment at 1175 Solano

**CEQA:** The project is Categorically exempt from CEQA pursuant to Section 15332 "In-Fill Development Projects" of the CEQA Guidelines.

Planning Manager Hersch presented the staff report dated July 14, 2021.

**Edgar Saldana**, applicant, reported live music is intended to attract customers and improve their dining experience. In response to neighbors' concerns, the number of days per week could be reduced to two, Tuesdays and Fridays. People across the street from the restaurant should not be able to hear the music if windows are closed. Live music is offered at other locations of Five Tacos and has been successful. When asked, Mr. Saldana advised that the patio doors were opened so that outdoor diners could enjoy the music. It is possible to keep the doors closed so that the sound is lower. Amplifiers can be adjusted to reduce the noise level or amplification of instruments can be eliminated. The location of performers and speakers can be adjusted to direct noise into the restaurant. The musical groups usually have three performers, but four have been present a few times. The first few times music was offered, it ended at 9:00 p.m. After neighbors complained, the music ended at 8:00 p.m.

#### PUBLIC HEARING OPENED

**Ben Lukas** emphasized that the music would impact nearby residents 16 hours per week, week after week. He suggested a condition of approval to measure noise inside residents' home and ensure the level complies with requirements. If noise levels exceed the allowed limits, action should be taken to reduce noise to the allowed limits.

**Clay Larson** suggested the City's noise meter needs to be calibrated and operated by a professional in order to provide accurate results.

### PUBLIC HEARING CLOSED

Planning Manager Hersch advised that the City has a noise meter that residents may borrow. Staff does not have technical expertise for noise monitoring. In the past, business owners were responsible for retaining an acoustical engineer to conduct a formal noise analysis.

Commissioner Pilch reported a gap in buildings allows noise from 1175 Solano Avenue to travel to the home at 915 Stannage. The occupants objected to the music on weekends when they wanted to enjoy their backyard.

Commissioner Donaldson stated receiving comments from eight nearby residents in opposition to a project is unusual. The neighbors offered good reasons for their concerns. Providing live music without obtaining a permit is a concern. The business seems successful without offering live music. If the Commission does not deny the application, it could impose additional conditions of approval to require the applicant to direct music indoors, allow only indoor performances, authorize staff to require an acoustical study if more than two or three neighbors complain about noise, and require a review in six months.

1

2

3

4

7 8 9

10 11

12

13 14 15

16

17

18

30

25

41

42

43

44

Chair Watty indicated her support for the business. After the past year under a pandemic, the City has an obligation to support local businesses. She proposed conditions of approval to require performances end at 8:00 p.m., a review in six months, a formal noise analysis after four performances, acoustic-only instruments, speakers face a direction that limits the amount of noise traveling outdoors, performers to be located inside the building, and entertainment be limited to no more than 25% of the square footage of the interior occupiable space.

Commissioner Pilch concurred with Chair Watty's proposed conditions and felt eliminating amplification of instruments would have the greatest effect on noise.

Planning Manager Hersh advised that the Fire Inspector requests a condition of approval to require the applicant to coordinate with the Fire Department regarding occupancy levels and paths of egress.

Motion to approve PA21-044 for 1175 Solano Avenue, Five Tacos, pursuant to the proposed findings and Conditions of Approval and additional Conditions of Approval requiring applicant to coordinate with the Fire Department regarding occupancy levels and paths of egress, performers to occupy no more than 25% of the restaurant's occupied square footage, performances to end at 8:00 p.m., a review in six months, applicant to coordinate with staff regarding a noise test during the first week of performances, all performers to be physically located within the building interior, and all instruments to be acoustic only. Watty Seconded by Pilch

Pilch, Watty AYES: NAYES: Donaldson

RECUSED: None

ABSENT: MacLeod, Momin

Motion passed, 2-1-0-2

Chair Watty noted the appeal period.

7-2. PA21-004 Conditional Use Permit & Design Review Amendment: New Mixed-Use Residential Building at 904 Masonic – The applicant is seeking Conditional Use Permit and Design Review approval to amend a previously approved mixeduse building at 904 Masonic Avenue. The subject site is 3,751-sq.-ft. lot with an existing 980-sq.-ft. single-story structure built in 1924. The original Planning & Zoning Commission approval was granted on February 13, 2019 and includes a new mixed-use commercial/residential project. The applicant is proposing to amend the project to include a live/work unit on the ground level of the building, consolidate two units on the 3<sup>rd</sup> floor into one unit, and eliminate the rooftop deck and off-street parking for the building. The building is proposed to be contemporary in design with a maximum height of 32'-5". This will result in a new mixed-use building with 1 ground-floor live/work unit and 3 residential units on top. A

1

2

8

13 14 15

16

17

18

30 31

25

32 33 34

35

36

37 38 39

40 41

42 43 44

Conditional Use Permit is required for the live/work unit to be located on the ground floor and to waive all off-street parking requirements. A Design Review amendment is required to eliminate the previously approved rooftop deck.

Recommendation: Staff recommends that the Planning & Zoning Commission review and approve the proposed project subject to the attached findings and Conditions of Approval.

**CEQA:** The project is Categorically exempt from CEQA pursuant to Section 15332 "In-Fill Development Projects" of the CEQA Guidelines.

Associate Planner Christopher Tan presented the staff report dated July 14, 2021.

Richard Tapp, project architect, reported the unit count has been reduced from five to four by consolidating the units on the third floor. The rear deck complements the building design and reduces the mass of the building. The proximity of essential services and amenities and the availability of public transportation, car and ride-share services, and bike paths support granting the parking waiver. The proposed transportation demand management (TDM) program includes ten bicycles, a secure storage building, and Clipper Cards. As public comment suggested, funding for Clipper Cards will be paid to the Metropolitan Transportation Commission rather than tenants. When asked, Mr. Tapp related that the north facade will be painted so that it represents the south facade, as originally approved.

### PUBLIC HEARING OPENED

An unidentified speaker expressed concern about the loss of one unit and the lack of onsite parking.

Clay Larson stated the number of last-minute changes seems to indicate the project is not ready for review. The Commission could likely justify granting a parking reduction rather than a parking waiver.

Mr. Tapp reported anecdotal studies over the past year have found that parking is always available along the east side of Masonic Avenue. The recent changes affect bike storage rather than the building. He indicated that City staff suggested replacing onsite parking with open space.

#### PUBLIC HEARING CLOSED

Commissioner Donaldson recalled his support for the original project. The current iteration is not nearly as desirable as the original. The primary issue is the parking waiver. The Commission does not have the ability to grant a parking waiver for the live/work unit. The walkway along the south side of the property could be replaced with a parking space

2

3

4

5 6

7

8

9

10

11

12 13

14

15

16

17

18 19

20

21 22

23

24 25

26 27 28

29

30

31

32

33 34

35

36 37

38

39 40

41 42 for the live/work unit. Tenants of the three-bedroom unit are likely to own a vehicle. Waiving off-street parking to obtain housing units is not good public policy. Clipper Cards should be provided to every occupant rather than every tenant. He suggested an additional condition of approval requiring the applicant to install a curb in the existing curb cut, which will add an on-street parking space.

Chair Watty felt the subject property is centrally located, many garages in Albany do not accommodate contemporary cars, and public rights-of-way should be for everyone. The project as proposed seems to be eligible for a parking reduction. The curb cut should be restored to curbing. The bike program is good. The number of Clipper Cards provided to tenants should be based on the number of bedrooms, and the monthly payment amount should align with typical transit costs.

Commissioner Pilch concurred with Chair Watty's suggestions for Clipper Cards. The applicant seems to have modified the project in response to comments made after the agenda was posted; however, some of the comments were made previously. A parking reduction is appropriate due to the property's location, the adequacy of on-street parking, the proposed mitigations, and the access to transit. Charging stations and electric bikes would improve the proposal. The applicant needs to provide storage space for long bikes. Given the last-minute revisions and the question about the Commission's ability to waive a parking space for the live/work unit, the Commission may not be prepared to vote on the project.

Commissioner Donaldson suggested the applicant provide an onsite parking space for the live/work unit or replace the curb cut with curbing to provide one on-street parking space in lieu of a parking space for the live/work unit.

Motion to approve PA21-004 for 904 Masonic pursuant to the proposed findings and Conditions of Approval and additional Conditions of Approval requiring restoration of the existing curb cut, the number of Clipper Cards align with the number of bedrooms per unit, each Clipper Card to be reloaded with an amount equal to the local monthly AC Transit pass, and the bicycle storage shed to accommodate seven standard bicycles and three cargo bicycles. Watty Seconded by Pilch

AYES: Pilch, Watty NAYES: Donaldson

RECUSED: None

ABSENT: MacLeod, Momin

Motion passed, 2-1-0-2

Chair Watty noted the appeal period.

1	8.	NEW BUSINESS
2 3		None
4 5	9.	NEXT MEETING – July 28, 2021, City Hall Council Chambers, 1000 San Pablo Avenue
6 7		or virtual meeting pursuant to state and county guidance
8 9	10.	ADJOURNMENT
10 11		The meeting was adjourned at 9:07 p.m.
12 13		
14		Submitted by: Anne Hersch, Planning Manager
15 16		
17		
18		Jeff Bond, Community Development Director