MINUTES OF REGULAR MEETING WEDNESDAY, JANUARY 13, 2021

1. CALL TO ORDER / PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE

Chair Watty called the regular meeting of the Planning and Zoning Commission to order at 7:03 p.m. on Wednesday, January 13, 2021.

2. ROLL CALL

Present: Donaldson, MacLeod, Momin, Pilch, Watty

Absent: None

Staff Present: Planning Manager Anne Hersch

Associate Planner Christopher Tan

City Clerk Anne Hsu

3. EX PARTE COMMUNICATIONS

None

4. CONSENT CALENDAR

4-1. Planning & Zoning Commission Meeting Minutes of December 9, 2020

Recommendation: Staff recommends that the Planning & Zoning Commission review and approve the meeting minutes.

4-2. PA 20-066 Request to Vacate Easement at 1198 Curtis Street – The applicant is seeking Planning Commission approval to vacate an existing private access easement at 1198 Curtis Street. The subject site is an 8,176-sq.-ft. vacant lot located in the R-1 Zoning District within the Watercourse Overlay Zone. The subject property was subdivided from the adjacent property at 1196 Curtis in 2010 and required to have a shared private access easement as a Condition of the final map. The applicant is seeking Commission approval to dissolve the private access easement and create a new, wider curb cut for proper vehicle access. If approved, each property will have a private driveway. The proposal includes an 18-foot-wide curb-cut for 1198 Curtis and a 12'-2"-wide curb-cut for 1196 Curtis. The project scope is limited to the removal of the private access easement and new curb cuts.

Recommendation: Staff recommends that the Planning & Zoning Commission table the matter pending project refinement.

CEQA: The project is Categorically exempt from CEQA pursuant to Section 15303 "New Construction or Conversion of Small Structures" of the CEQA Guidelines.

PUBLIC HEARING OPENED

None

PUBLIC HEARING CLOSED

Motion to approve the consent calendar. Donaldson

Seconded by MacLeod

AYES: Donaldson, MacLeod, Momin (Item 4-2), Pilch (Item 4-2), Watty

NAYES: None

ABSTAINING: Momin (Item 4-1), Pilch (Item 4-1)

ABSENT: None **Motion passed**, 5-0-0-0

Chair Watty noted the 14-day appeal period.

5. PUBLIC COMMENT

None

6. DISCUSSION & POSSIBLE ACTION ON MATTERS RELATED TO THE FOLLOWING ITEMS:

6-1. PA 20-065 Design Review & Conditional Use Permit for a Two-Story Addition at 1106 Neilson Street – The applicant is seeking Design Review and Conditional Use Permit approval for a two-story addition at 1106 Neilson Street. The subject property is a 3,750-sq.-ft. lot with a 3-bedroom, 1.5-bathroom, 1,460-sq.-ft. house built in 1927. The applicant is proposing a 760-sq.-ft. second-story addition directly on top of the existing home. The addition is proposed to accommodate a master suite, office, bathroom and bedroom. The existing Craftsman style of the home is proposed to remain. This will result in a 4-bedroom, 3.5-bathroom, 1,914-sq.-ft. home with a maximum height of 22'-7". Parking is provided in the garage and driveway. A Conditional Use Permit is required to extend existing non-conforming walls located 3.3 feet where 3.75 feet is required.

Recommendation: Staff recommends that the Planning & Zoning Commission review and approve the project request subject to the findings and Conditions of Approval.

CEQA: The project is Categorically exempt from CEQA pursuant to Section 15303 "New Construction or Conversion of Small Structures" of the CEQA Guidelines.

Associate Planner Christopher Tan presented the staff report dated January 13, 2021.

Howard McNenny, project architect, reported that he has discussed the neighbors' concerns about privacy and shade with them. The project will improve privacy and sunlight for the neighbors because of the deck and distance between the homes. Earlier in the day, he observed that the neighbors' blinds were closed on all windows except those facing the street. The roof is as low as possible without affecting the architectural character of the house. When asked, Mr. McNenny indicated the windows will be aluminum-clad wood. Some of the existing windows may be replaced, but that has not been determined. The ceiling of the existing laundry room will be raised so that the floor above is one level.

PUBLIC HEARING OPENED

Alison Marshall, 1104 Neilson Street, advised that the project will shade one side of her home. The deck will look into her master bedroom and backyard. She questioned the purpose of the deck when the property owners have told her they do not plan to utilize the deck. In addition, she consulted an architect who advised her that a different configuration could provide more sunlight for her dining room.

Jeremiah Pinguelo suggested the neighbors and property owners mediate the issues. The Commission does not seem to consider the human aspect of disagreements.

Greg Chiarella, property owner, related that all but one window was replaced before he moved into the home. The one window will be replaced. He has worked extensively with Mr. McNenny to minimize impacts on neighbors. He plans to use the deck periodically. One bedroom in his home looks into one bedroom in the Marshalls' home, but blinds in both rooms are usually closed. Elevating the home will reduce views from his home into the Marshalls' home.

PUBLIC HEARING CLOSED

Commissioner Donaldson appreciated the design, the consistency of the addition with the existing structure, and the materials. The plan set does not include a landscape plan, but the existing landscaping in the front yard is quite good and recent. The distances between most homes in Albany are quite small, and window treatments or vegetation is often used to mitigate privacy impacts. Topographically, the house at 1104 Neilson is higher than the subject house, which mitigates shade impacts. The window at the top of the stairs and the window in the office could be modified to increase privacy. Solid railings on the rear deck could mitigate privacy impacts.

Commissioner Pilch noted existing bedrooms in each house face one another. The neighbor's privacy concern may be the deck looking into a bedroom. He concurred with the use of an opaque railing on the deck. Shade impacts are mitigated by the driveway located between the two properties. The partial gables are not a concern. A trellis or tall plants on the deck could provide some screening.

Commissioner McLeod liked the overall design of the project. Windows on most Albany homes look into adjacent homes. In his experience, decks are not used frequently; therefore, an opaque railing on the north side should be fine. The distance between the homes is adequate for sunlight, and the deck will improve the neighbor's access to sunlight. The south elevation of the addition would look more uniform if the narrow windows were the same width as the windows near the bay. The partial gables look odd and should be removed. Opaque glazing in the lower half of the window at the top of the stairs and clerestory windows in the office would be fine.

Commissioner Momin appreciated the intention to continue the original style of the house. The deck will mitigate shade impacts but compromise privacy. Full-height screening will be more beneficial than opaque railing. With the glass partition between the office and stair and a larger window between the stair and the deck, the large window in the office could be reduced in size or eliminated. Because of the different floor heights at 1104 and 1106 Neilson and 1104 Neilson's location north of the subject property, 1104 Neilson will receive ample sunlight during the morning and evening hours. There are too many window sizes and types. Placing the upstairs bathroom

in a prime location within the house is not ideal. The horizontal window in the bathroom is not compatible with the bay window. The partial gables may be intended to break up the massing, but eyebrow awnings above the windows would look better. The type of window proposed for the rear of the master bedroom should be used at the front of the house.

Chair Watty related that shade and privacy issues often conflict. The neighbors may prefer a different configuration, but the property owners have made some sensitive decisions. Each person has a different tolerance for privacy, and property owners change. However, neighbors should attempt to reach compromises. The window at the top of the stair could be removed, and a skylight installed. A solid railing along the north side of the deck can increase privacy and hide clutter. The railing could also be taller than 42 inches. The addition should be compatible but not seamless with the original structure. The window pattern on the south elevation should be more uniform.

Motion to approve PA 20-065 for 1106 Neilson Street pursuant to the proposed findings and Conditions of Approval and additional Conditions of Approval to replace the window at the top of the stair with a skylight or transom window, install a 42-inch-tall solid railing along the north side of the deck, and work with staff to regularize the window pattern on the south elevation, all subject to staff approval. Donaldson

Seconded by Pilch

AYES: Donaldson, MacLeod, Momin, Pilch, Watty

NAYES: None
ABSTAINING: None
ABSENT: None
Motion passed, 5-0-0-0

Chair Watty noted the 14-day appeal period.

7. NEW BUSINESS

None

8. ANNOUNCEMENTS/COMMUNICATIONS/DISCUSSION

8-1. Planning Commission Chair & Vice Chair Reorganization

Commissioner Donaldson nominated Commissioner Watty for the office of Chair. Commissioner Pilch nominated Commissioner MacLeod for the office of Chair; however, Commissioner MacLeod declined the nomination.

AYES: Donaldson, MacLeod, Momin, Pilch, Watty

NAYES: None ABSTAINING: None ABSENT: None

Nomination approved, 5-0-0-0

Commissioner MacLeod nominated Commissioner Pilch for the office of Vice Chair.

AYES: Donaldson, MacLeod, Momin, Pilch, Watty

NAYES: None ABSTAINING: None ABSENT: None

Nomination approved, 5-0-0-0

8-2. 2023-2031 Housing Element

Planning Manager Anne Hersch announced Barry Miller is the City's consultant for preparation of the 2023-2031 Housing Element, which will probably begin in February 2021. Rincon Consultants will take the lead for California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) review.

Commissioners discussed requirements for the Housing Element, the Regional Housing Needs Allocation (RHNA) and methodology, the University of California's (UC) proposed student housing development, and the San Pablo Avenue Specific Plan.

PUBLIC HEARING OPENED

Eric Biber noted recent changes in State laws that increase the powers of local governments to provide for housing and the obligations to do so. He shared provisions that should be included in the Housing Element.

Jeremiah Pinguelo asked if a Commissioner is assigned to attend the 2x2x2 meetings. UC's proposed development will provide 800 units, but the project will eliminate open space.

PUBLIC HEARING CLOSED

9. NEXT MEETING – January 27, 2021, City Hall Council Chambers, 1000 San Pablo Avenue or virtual meeting pursuant to state and county guidance

10. ADJOURNMENT

The meeting was adjourned at 8:44 p.m.	
Submitted by: Anne Hersch, Planning Manager	
Jeff Bond, Community Development Director	