

# City of Albany

## Planning & Zoning Commission Minutes of September 14, 2016 Meeting

Note: These minutes are subject to Planning and Zoning Commission approval. The minutes are not verbatim. An audiotape of the meeting is available for public review.

### Regular Meeting

1. **CALL TO ORDER:** The regular meeting of the Planning & Zoning Commission was called to order by Chair Giesen-Fields in the City Council Chambers at 7:00 P.M. on Wednesday, September 14, 2016.

2. **PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE**

3. **ROLL CALL**

Present: Friedland, Kent, Menotti, Giesen-Fields

Absent: Donaldson

Staff Present: City Planner Anne Hersch

Associate Planner Christopher Tan

4. **CONSENT CALENDAR**

City Planner Hersch advised that staff would remove Item C from Consent to allow a formal presentation; Commissioner Kent requested the removal of Item B; and Chair Giesen-Fields requested the removal of Items A and D. As such, every item on the Consent Calendar was removed for discussion.

#### A. **Planning & Zoning Commission Meeting Minutes from July 27, 2016**

Chair Giesen-Fields requested the following amendments to the minutes:

- Page 6, line 8: *"He [Chair Giesen Fields] was particularly concerned that the buttresses would reduce the useable parking areas because the buttress was in the space needed to park a car in the garage.*
- Page 6 line 11: *Mr. Kaldis stated that he had already checked and verified that the proposed buttress would not affect the clear dimensions required for a car to use the garage.*
- Page 9, line 1, second sentence: *He [Chair Giesen-Fields] supported the applicant's willingness to adjust the grading and relocating the utility service to mitigate any runoff from the applicant's site running onto the neighbor's property.*

- To Page 9, line 20: *Yvonne Tom, the property owner, expressly stated that it was her and her husband's intention to live in the house which was the reason for the renovation and addition.*

**Motion to approve Consent Item 4A, Planning & Zoning Commission Meeting Minutes from July 27, 2016, as amended.** Giesen-Fields

Seconded by: Friedland

AYES: Friedland, Kent, Giesen-Fields

NAYES: None

ABSTAIN: Menotti

ABSENT: Donaldson

**Motion passed, 3-0-1-1**

- B. PA 16-064 Design Review and Parking Reduction for a Second Story Addition at 733 Jackson Street.** The applicant is seeking Design Review and Parking Reduction approval for an 808 square foot addition at the basement level of an existing home at 733 Jackson Street. The subject site is a 3,750 square foot lot with a three bedroom, two bathroom house built in 1928. The applicant is proposing a basement level addition to accommodate a new bedroom, bathroom, closet, and living/sun room. A new roof top deck will also be provided on the basement roof. This will result in a four bedroom, three bathroom 2,062 square foot home with a maximum height of 22 feet 2 inches. A single parking space is provided in the existing driveway space in the front yard. A Parking Reduction is required as there is insufficient room for an additional off-street parking space. The home will retain its quasi-Craftsman appearance.  
**Recommendation: Review and approve subject to the findings and Conditions of Approval attached to the staff report dated September 14, 2016.**

*CEQA: The project is Categorically exempt pursuant to Section 15303 "New Construction or Conversion of Small Structures."*

City Planner Hersch presented the staff report dated September 14, 2016.

Commissioner Kent had pulled the item due to the plain front yard; given the requirement for exceptional design since the proposal exceeded .45 floor area ratio (FAR), he recommended that something, such as a shrub, be planted in the front.

**Maya Watts**, the property owner, reported that the front yard would be re-landscaped after the renovations had been completed and that the trash cans would be stored away from public view.

PUBLIC COMMENTS OPENED

There was no one to speak.

1  
2 PUBLIC COMMENTS CLOSED

3 **Motion to approve Consent Item 4B, PA 16-064 for 733 Jackson Street,**  
4 **subject to the submittal of a landscape plan, and pursuant to the staff report**  
5 **dated September 14, 2016.** Friedland

6 Seconded by: Kent

7 AYES: Friedland, Kent, Menotti, Giesen-Fields

8 NAYES: None

9 ABSENT: Donaldson

10 **Motion passed, 4-0-1**

11  
12 Chair Giesen-Fields identified the 14-day appeal period.

- 13  
14 **C. PA 16-051 Design Review and Parking Exception for a Second Story Addition**  
15 **at 726 Madison Street.** The applicant is seeking approval for Design Review  
16 and Parking Exception for a second story addition at 726 Madison Street.  
17 The subject site is 5,000 square feet with an existing 1,196 square foot two  
18 bedroom, two bathroom house built in 1929. The applicant is proposing a  
19 433 square foot first story addition and a 763 square foot second story  
20 addition. The addition includes a new family room, master bedroom with  
21 a balcony, an additional bedroom, a new bathroom, as well as a large  
22 deck and sitting room space. This will result in a four bedroom, three  
23 bathroom, 2,711.2 square foot home with a maximum height of 24 feet 4  
24 inches. The existing Spanish Revival style is proposed to be carried through  
25 in the design through matching roof materials and wood railing details. A  
26 parking exception is required to allow an off-street parking space in the  
27 front yard setback. **Recommendation: Review and approve subject to the**  
28 **findings and Conditions of Approval attached to the staff report dated**  
29 **September 14, 2016.**

30  
31 *CEQA: The project is Categorically exempt pursuant to Section 15303 "New*  
32 *Construction or Conversion of Small Structures."*

33  
34 City Planner Hersch presented the staff report dated September 14, 2016.

35  
36 **Sharif Ahmed**, the applicant, advised that the expansion had been proposed to add much  
37 needed space for her family, to improve the parking situation, and there would be three  
38 and not four bathrooms.

39  
40 **Francisco Matos**, the Project Architect, described the design in relation to the applicant's  
41 needs, the maintenance of the Spanish Revival style, and the stepped back design to  
42 allow light to the neighbors.

43  
44 PUBLIC COMMENTS OPENED

45

1 **Luna Alonso Glasner**, the next door neighbor, expressed concern with the size of the  
2 addition, a reduction of sunlight and privacy, construction impacts, and sought a  
3 reduction of height.  
4

5 **Rebecca Angel**, 727 Jackson Street, expressed concern for the planting on the applicant's  
6 property affecting her property and sought collaboration with the applicant to address  
7 those concerns; and expressed concern for the construction schedule and the height of  
8 the addition.  
9

10 **Katie Smith**, Jackson Street, suggested the proposal was too massive in scale and  
11 inconsistent with the neighborhood.  
12

13 **Dyana Vukovich**, 720 Madison, expressed concern for the mass of the proposal and for  
14 construction noise.  
15

16 **Alexa Hauser**, a member of the Diverse Housing Working Group, supported the project that  
17 would include multi-generations.  
18

19 PUBLIC COMMENTS CLOSED  
20

21 **The Commission made the following comments and suggestions:**  
22

- 23 • Requested more organic, terrace stepped retaining walls that would create a  
24 more inviting front yard; suggested the ceiling structure of the existing building  
25 be evaluated to see how the height could be reduced; and requested  
26 consideration of the orientation of the roofline on the second floor and the roof  
27 slope of the new addition in terms of the pitch of the slope to address the height  
28 of the building. (Chair Giesen-Fields)  
29
- 30 • Responded to concerns related to construction hours and staff verified that  
31 while the applicant could voluntarily reduce construction hours the hours were  
32 set by the Albany Municipal Code. (Commissioner Menotti)  
33
- 34 • Clarified with respect to obstruction of light to the neighbors that the only  
35 shadowing would be in December and January; suggested the entire proposed  
36 second floor addition could be shifted to Madison to take the bulk away from  
37 Jackson; liked the parking the way it was; and reiterated the importance of a  
38 landscape plan. (Commissioner Kent)  
39

40 **Motion to continue Consent Item 4C, PA 16-051 for 726 Madison Street, to a**  
41 **date certain of September 28, 2016, with the addition of a landscape plan**  
42 **and with a request that the applicant revise the design as suggested by the**  
43 **Commission, with the revised design to be submitted to staff no later than**  
44 **September 20, 2016 at 5:00 P.M.** Giesen-Fields

45 Seconded by: Friedland

46 AYES: Friedland, Kent, Menotti, Giesen-Fields

1 NAYES: None  
2 ABSENT: Donaldson  
3 **Motion passed, 4-0-1**  
4  
5

6 **D. PA 16-062 Design Review for a Second Story Addition at 941 Key Route**  
7 **Boulevard.** The applicant is seeking Design Review approval of a second  
8 story addition at 941 Key Route Boulevard. The subject site is a 4,683 square  
9 foot lot with an existing 1,052 square foot three bedroom, one bathroom  
10 house built in 1918. The applicant is proposing to add a 399 square foot  
11 two-story addition in the rear of the house. The first floor addition includes  
12 a 97 square foot addition, and interior reconfiguration. The 302 square foot  
13 second story addition includes a new master suite. This will result in a three  
14 bedroom, two bathroom 1,449 square foot home with a maximum height  
15 of 20 feet 7 inches. Two off-street legal parking spaces are provided in the  
16 single-car detached garage and driveway. The home will maintain its  
17 Minimal Traditional appearance. **Recommendation: Review and approve**  
18 **subject to the findings and Conditions of Approval attached to the staff**  
19 **report dated September 14, 2016.**  
20

21 *CEQA: The project is Categorically exempt pursuant to Section 15303 "New*  
22 *Construction or Conversion of Small Structures."*  
23

24 **Jimmy Kwong**, the project designer, responded to the Chair's concern for the eaves and  
25 explained that the eaves could be extended to fill in the gaps on both sides to make it look  
26 like a unified whole.  
27

28 PUBLIC COMMENTS OPENED  
29

30 There was no one to speak.  
31

32 PUBLIC COMMENTS CLOSED  
33

34 **Motion to approve Consent Item 4D, PA 16-062 for 941 Key Route Boulevard,**  
35 **with the extension of the eaves at the existing structure at least one foot**  
36 **onto the new addition, and pursuant to the staff report dated September 14,**  
37 **2016.** Giesen-Fields

38 Seconded by: Menotti  
39 AYES: Friedland, Kent, Menotti, Giesen-Fields  
40 NAYES: None  
41 ABSENT: Donaldson  
42 **Motion passed, 4-0-1**  
43

44 Chair Giesen-Fields identified the 14-day appeal period.  
45

46 **5. PUBLIC COMMENT**

1  
2 **Alexa Hauser** described a meeting related to the creation of shared housing in small,  
3 medium, and large existing homes, and reported that a two-hour session had been  
4 scheduled to provide information learned at that shared housing meeting. She also spoke  
5 to Measure A1, an Alameda County Housing Bond and urged the endorsement of that  
6 bond.

7  
8 **6. DISCUSSIONS AND POSSIBLE ACTION ON MATTERS RELATED TO THE FOLLOWING**  
9 **ITEMS:**

10  
11 Commissioner Menotti recused himself from the discussion of PA 16-063.

12  
13 **A. PA 16-063 Design Review and Parking Reduction for 1113 Ordway Street.**

14 The applicant is seeking approval of Design Review and Parking Reduction  
15 approval for a second story addition at 113 Ordway Street. The subject site  
16 is a 7,525 square foot lot with a two bedroom, one bathroom 1,354 square  
17 foot house built in 1926. The applicant is proposing a two-story 946 square  
18 foot addition at the rear of the home. The applicant has proposed to  
19 remove two bedrooms on the first floor at the rear of the home in order to  
20 accommodate a new family room and office space. The applicant  
21 proposes a second story addition which will accommodate a new master  
22 suite and a new bedroom. This will result in a two bedroom, two bathroom,  
23 2,300 square foot home with a maximum height of 27 feet 3 inches. A single  
24 parking space is provided in the existing garage. The applicant is  
25 requesting a Parking Reduction due to insufficient space to build an  
26 additional legal parking space. **Recommendation. Review and approve**  
27 **subject to the findings and Conditions of Approval attached to the staff**  
28 **report dated September 14, 2016.**

29  
30 *CEQA: The project is Categorically exempt pursuant to Section 15303 "New*  
31 *Construction or Conversion of Small Structures."*

32  
33 Commissioner Menotti recused himself and left the City Council Chambers.

34  
35 Associate Planner Christopher Tan presented the staff report dated September 14, 2016.

36  
37 **Kate Toran**, the applicant, described the project and the design intended to minimize  
38 impacts to the neighbors, stated the proposal had been shared with the neighbors, and  
39 letters had been submitted in support of the project.

40  
41 PUBLIC COMMENTS OPENED

42  
43 There was no one to speak.

44  
45 PUBLIC COMMENTS CLOSED

46

1 **Motion to approve PA 16-063 for 1113 Ordway Street, pursuant to the staff**  
2 **report dated September 14, 2016.** Kent

3 Seconded by: Giesen-Fields

4 AYES: Friedland, Kent, Giesen-Fields

5 NAYES: None

6 ABSENT: Donaldson, Menotti (recused)

7 **Motion passed, 3-0-2**

8  
9 Chair Giesen-Fields identified the 14-day appeal period.

10  
11 Commissioner Menotti rejoined the Commission.

12  
13 **B. \*\* Study Session \*\* PA 16-508 Design Review Second Story Addition and**  
14 **Parking Reduction at 720 Spokane Avenue.**

15 The applicant is seeking Design Review and Parking Reduction approval for  
16 a second story addition at 720 Spokane Avenue. The subject site is a 3,675  
17 square foot lot with an existing two bedroom, one bathroom house built in  
18 1932. The applicant is proposing to add 447 square feet at the rear of the  
19 building on the first floor. This will accommodate a new family room in  
20 addition to a kitchen remodel. The upper level addition is proposed to be  
21 414 square feet and includes a new master suite. This will result in a three  
22 bedroom, two bathroom 1,932 square foot home with a maximum height  
23 of 28 feet. The existing garage will accommodate one off-street parking  
24 space. The applicant is requesting a parking reduction due to insufficient  
25 room on-site for an additional legal size parking space. **Recommendation:**  
26 **Review and approve subject to the findings and Conditions of Approval**  
27 **attached to the staff report dated September 14, 2016.**

28  
29 *CEQA: The project is Categorically exempt pursuant to Section 15303 "New*  
30 *Construction or Conversion of Small Structures."*

31  
32 Mr. Tan presented the staff report dated September 14, 2016.

33  
34 Commissioner Friedland clarified that staff had offered recommendations to the applicant  
35 as part of the application process and the applicant had declined to accept those  
36 recommendations.

37  
38 **Yang Chen**, the applicant, explained that the home required more room to  
39 accommodate his family.

40  
41 **The Commission made the following comments and suggestions:**

- 42  
43 • Expressed concern for the small windows in the front and while being advised that  
44 smaller windows had been proposed given the close proximity of the home to BART  
45 and the desire to avoid excessive noise, the Commission expressed a desire to see  
46 a larger rectangular window in the front to break up the blank wall, offered

1 suggestions for the windows in the rear, and urged the applicant to think how the  
2 design related to the rest of the house. Given the high FAR, the Commission  
3 explained that exceptional design was required; the Commission supported the  
4 staff recommendations and urged the applicant to consider those  
5 recommendations when revising the project; requested a landscape plan; and  
6 encouraged the applicant to review the Residential Design Guidelines when  
7 considering modifications to the plan.

8  
9 **7. NEW BUSINESS**

10  
11 A. None

12  
13 **8. ANNOUNCEMENTS/COMMUNICATIONS/DISCUSSION**

14  
15 Ms. Hersch advised that the next meeting would include a review of the Residential Design  
16 Guidelines, and an implementation from the General Plan to update the Design  
17 Guidelines.

18  
19 **9. NEXT MEETING:** September 28, 2016

20  
21 **10. ADJOURNMENT**

22  
23 The meeting was adjourned at approximately 9:00 P.M.

24 Next regular meeting: Wednesday, September 28, 2016 at 7:00 P.M. at Albany City Hall.

25  
26  
27  
28 \_\_\_\_\_  
29 Submitted by: Anne Hersch, City Planner

30  
31  
32 \_\_\_\_\_  
33 **Jeff Bond, Community Development Director**  
34